
Site Address: War Memorial, St Faiths Church, West Street, Havant, PO9
1EH

Proposal: Variation of Condition 2 of Listed Building Consent APP/15/01356 for
the retention of font type 'Copperplate Gothic Bold' in respect of existing and future
commemorations.

Application No: APP/16/00707

Expiry Date: 02/09/2016

Applicant: Mrs D Pink
Havant Borough Council

Agent: N/A

Case Officer: Rachael McMurray

Ward: St Faiths

Reason for Committee Consideration: Havant Borough Council application

HPS Recommendation: **GRANT PERMISSION**

1 Site Description

- 1.1 The application site is located at St Faiths Church in Havant Town Centre and within the St Faiths Conservation Area and comprises a monument which serves as a war memorial. The monument is positioned at the junction of North, South, West and East Streets in front of St Faiths Church.
- 1.2 The monument is a Grade II listed structure made from stone with flint brick work detailing. It was erected in 1922 to commemorate the fallen of WWI and originally comprised 8no. bronze panels. Further panels were added to the monument after WWII.
- 1.3 Following a recent listed building consent (see Section 2 for full details) two further plaques have been erected on the War Memorial. One of these replaced an existing plaque.

2 Planning History

APP/15/01241

Listed Building Consent for additional plaque for War Memorial and change fixings to some of existing plaques. Approved on 20/1/16

APP/15/01356

Listed Building Consent for 2no. additional plaques (one to replace existing). Approved on 20/1/16

3 Proposal

- 3.1 Following the grant of Listed Building Consent APP/15/01356, two plaques have recently been installed on the War Memorial. Condition 2 of Planning Permission APP/15/01356 stated:

'The font size and style to be used on the plaques shall match that used on other World War II commemorative plaques on the War Memorial.

Reason: *In the interests of the architectural and historic interest of the listed building and having due regard to Policy CS16 of the Havant Borough Local Plan (Core Strategy)*

2011, Policy DM20 of the Havant Borough Local Plan (Allocations) 2014 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2012'.

- 3.2 However, the font used on the new plaques is 'Copperplate Gothic Bold' which does not match in style that on the existing WWII plaques. This application therefore seeks to regularise the situation by seeking consent for the variation of Condition 2 of Listed Building Consent APP/15/01356 to enable the retention of font type 'Copperplate Gothic Bold' in respect of existing and future commemorations.

4 Policy Considerations

National Planning Policy Framework 2012

Havant Borough Local Plan (Core Strategy) March 2011

CS11 (Protecting and Enhancing the Special Environment and Heritage of Havant Borough)

Havant Borough Local Plan (Allocations) July 2014

DM20 (Historic Assets)

Listed Building Grade: Grade II

Conservation Area: St Faiths

5 Statutory and Non Statutory Consultations

Conservation Officer:

This proposal is for a variation of condition 2 of Listed Building Consent APP/16/00707. Following my site visit the following inconsistencies exist between the WWII plaques and recently added Post WWII plaques:

- The typeface is not the same
- The colour (patina) of the plaques is brown as opposed to black, although this may weather slightly over time
- The size of the lettering for the regiment and rank of each individual commemorated is not in the same proportion to the name as per the WWII plaques
- There are no commas after the names as per the WWI and WWII plaques

Whilst there are clear inconsistencies between the new plaques and WWII plaques it should also be noted that there are clear inconsistencies between the WWI and WWII plaques.

It could therefore be argued that precedence for adding new plaques in an authentic manner has been established. The historic significance of the War Memorial lies largely in its appearance and design.

I do not believe the proposals as submitted greatly detract from this significance as this appears to have been previously compromised with the addition of the WWII plaques. The position of the proposed plaques on the flanks of the war memorial has also helped to reduce any harm that might have been considered.

Whilst it would have been preferable to have faithful reproduction of the WWII plaques the proposals continue the evolution/change that has previously occurred on the war memorial. As the War Memorial Trust state 'there is an acceptable rationale behind adding additional plaques in an authentic style'.

As such I have no objection to the variation of condition 2.

Historic England:

No objections

War Memorials Trust:

Having looked at the plaques, there are the following inconsistencies between the WWII and Post-WWII plaques:

- The typeface is not the same
- The colour (patina) of the plaques is brown as opposed to black, although this may weather slightly over time
- The size of the lettering for the regiment and rank of each individual commemorated is not in the same proportion to the name as per the WWII plaques
- There are no commas after the names as per the WWI and WWII plaques

Replication issues

One of the issues which has arisen as part of the project to replicate the original WWII plaques is the difficulty of producing a similar design. Following discussions with the Estates Team, WMT is aware that considerable effort has been made to find a way to match the original plaques as close as possible.

The majority of bronze plaques are now produced using standard typefaces with a computer, which would have been done by hand when the WWII plaques were originally added to the war memorial. This would very much have depended on the skill of the original engraver and could potentially be difficult to replicate.

WMT has been involved in a number of cases previously where an original typeface has been reproduced. However, in these instances the plaques were cast bronze plaques with raised lettering as opposed to engraved plaques. As a result, it may be difficult to reproduce the original typeface.

Historic addition of plaques

WMT's advice regarding adding names to war memorials is based on the principle that names from subsequent conflict have been added in the same style as the First World War names. This is the case at Fareham war memorial where names were inscribed on inset stone panels in the same typeface. However, at Havant the WWII names were engraved onto bronze plaques as opposed to the original cast plaques. As a result, Havant war memorial has a history of authentic addition of names for subsequent conflicts. If the plaques which are being considered as part of this Listed Building Consent application were for further WWII names WMT would advise these must be in the same style.

WMT feel that this history of authentic addition of names should be taken into account in response to the request to vary condition 2. The addition of dissimilar WWII plaques following the end of the war provides a precedent for adding plaques in an authentic manner which avoids adversely affecting the architectural significance of the war memorial. It should be noted that if these WWII plaques were cast in bronze as opposed to engraved, WMT would insist these should be in the same style.

Decision

Based on the above comments, WMT do not wish to raise any objections to the variation of condition 2 of Listed Building Consent application APP/16/007/07. Although we do not think the current situation is ideal there is an acceptable rationale behind adding additional plaques in an authentic style.

6 Community Involvement

This application was publicised in accordance with the Council's Code of Practice for Publicity of Planning Applications approved at minute 207/6/92 (as amended), as a result of which the following publicity was undertaken:

Number of neighbour notification letters sent: 9

Number of site notices: 1

Statutory advertisement: 22/07/2016

Number of representations received: 0

7 Planning Considerations

- 7.1 When making a decision on a listed building consent application, a local planning authority must have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. Preservation in this context means not harming the interest in the building, as opposed to keeping it utterly unchanged. This obligation, found in sections 16 and 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, applies to all decisions concerning listed buildings.
- 7.2 Having regard to this legislative background, and relevant policies of the development plan, it is considered that the main issue arising from this application is:
- (i) Effect on the listed monument's preservation and its features of architectural or historic interest**
- 7.3 Policy DM20 (Historic Assets) advises that planning permission will be granted for development that conserves and enhances the historic assets of Havant Borough. Protecting and enhancing the historic environment is also one of the core principles of the NPPF. Both the Council's Conservation Officer and the War Memorials Trust have identified inconsistencies between the WWII plaques and the post WWII plaques, one of these being that the typeface is not the same which was a requirement of Condition 2 of Planning Permission APP/15/01356. However, both consultees point out that there are inconsistencies between the WWI and WWII plaques and therefore it could be argued that precedence for adding new plaques in an authentic manner has been established.
- 7.4 The historic significance of the War Memorial lies largely in its appearance and design and it is considered that the font used on the new plaques does not in itself greatly detract from this significance as this appears to have been previously compromised with the addition of the WWII plaques. Whilst it would have been preferable to have faithful reproduction of the WWII plaques, the consultees are of the view that the proposals continue the evolution/change that has previously occurred on the war memorial. As the War Memorial Trust state 'there is an acceptable rationale behind adding additional plaques (with the Copperplate font) in an authentic style'.

7.5 It is therefore considered that the proposal to retain the existing typeface on the plaques will still preserve the special architectural and historic interest of the monument and accords with Policies CS11 and DM20 of the Local Plan and Section 12 of the NPPF. and as such is recommended for approval.

8 Conclusion

8.1 Having had special regard to the desirability of preserving the war memorial and its features of special architectural or historic interest, the proposal to retain the existing typeface on the plaques is considered to be acceptable for the reasons discussed above and is therefore recommended for listed building consent.

9 RECOMMENDATION:

That the Head of Planning be authorised to **GRANT PERMISSION** for application APP/16/00707 subject to the following condition:

1. The font size to be used on the plaques shall match that used on other World War II commemorative plaques on the War Memorial; the font style shall be 'Copperplate Gothic Bold'.

Reason: In the interests of the architectural and historic interest of the listed building and having due regard to Policy CS11 of the Havant Borough Local Plan (Core Strategy) 2011, Policy DM20 of the Havant Borough Local Plan (Allocations) 2014 and the National Planning Policy Framework 2012.

Appendices:

- Appendix A – Site Plan
- Appendix B1 – Memorial front elevation
- Appendix B2 – Memorial front elevation
- Appendix C1 – Photograph of plaque on War Memorial
- Appendix C2 – Photograph of plaque on War Memorial